Preprint version – Appendix to:

Jodi Schneider, Di Ye, Alison M Hill, Ashley S Whitehorn. (2020). "Continued post-retraction citation of a fraudulent clinical trial report, eleven years after it was retracted for falsifying data." *Scientometrics*. doi (pending): 10.1007/s11192-020-03631-1

Open access final publication *to appear* at http://doi.org/10.1007/s11192-020-03631-1 Appendix preprint: http://jodischneider.com/pubs/scientometrics2020-appendix.pdf Paper preprint: http://jodischneider.com/pubs/scientometrics2020-appendix.pdf

See also

Datasets:

First-generation citation context analysis <u>https://doi.org/10.13012/B2IDB-8150563_V1</u> Second-generation citation context analysis <u>https://doi.org/10.13012/B2IDB-1403534_V2</u> Citation network <u>https://doi.org/10.13012/B2IDB-1403534_V2</u>

Detailed Methods and Supplemental Results

for "Continued Post-Retraction Citation of a Fraudulent Clinical Trial Report, Eleven Years after it was retracted for Falsifying Data"

I. Analysis of the direct citations to the Matsuyama paper

Appendix Figure 1 outlines the process we used for analyzing the direct citations to the Matsuyama paper.

Matsuyama paper



Appendix Fig. 1 Flow diagram for the analysis of the direct citations to the Matsuyama paper

Search

We searched Web of Science and Google Scholar for publications citing the Matsuyama paper. All forms of publications, published before December 31, 2019, in any language were included. Our search was conducted iteratively, as we refined our deduplication and cross-checking procedures over time. Our main data collection took place on April 25, 2019 for Web of Science¹ and from April 25, 2019 to May 4, 2019 using Publish or Perish (Harzing, 2007) for Google Scholar. Items from publication year 2019 were temporarily excluded, and sought in an update search after year end, as described below.

Deduplication

We deduplicated records when multiple copies were found. For title matches or partial title matches, we compared the full metadata record (author, publisher, etc.) or linked publication in order to identify duplicates. Subsequently we spot-checked publications with the same author, same publication year, or same venue. When we found near-matches we checked for errors, and updated Google Scholar metadata where, e.g. book-level authors were listed instead of chapter-level authors, or where missing dates in blog-style websites could be attributed to dates in slug-style URLs.

Cross-checking with previous searches

We included all items from any search once they had been manually verified through the citation context analysis. An additional 7 items were included from earlier searches (from Web of Science on July 6, 2018, and from Google Scholar on July 15, 2018). An additional 9 items reported in (Fulton et al., 2015) were also included.

Update search

We searched for new 2019 publications on Google Scholar and Web of Science. Citing items found in any search before January 15, 2020 were included, resulting in an additional 8 items.²

What counts as post-retraction citation

There is no universal operationalization of the time period comprising "post-retraction citation" (Chen et al., 2013). Possible interpretations include the month and year of retraction, the start of the calendar year following retraction, or a washout period of one to two years to account for time to publication. For the purpose of deeming articles as post-retraction, we use a 2-month washout period after the October 2008 retraction notice (CHEST, 2008). Thus, citations from the Matsuyama paper's publication in December 2005 through December 2008 are considered pre-retraction while citations from January 2009 to December 31, 2019 (the end date of our study) are considered post-retraction.

Self-citation

In this case, there is minimal self-citation. We found 2 self-citations written by any of the 7 authors of the Matsuyama paper, both published before the 2008 retraction notice (CHEST, 2008). Two years before the Matsuyama paper was retracted, *Chest* printed a letter to the editor about possible

¹ <u>https://github.com/infoqualitylab/Retraction-Case-Study-</u>

Matsuyama/blob/master/Python%20Code/wos%20web%20scraping.py

² Google Scholar results change frequently. One thesis, found in the Jan 12, 2020 Google Scholar search and manually verified, no longer appeared in our February 4, 2020 search.

confounding treatments in the Matsuyama paper; a letter from the authors replied (Matsuyama et al., 2006) (and this letter has not been cited). The second self-citation (Matsuyama et al., 2007) was published in the English-language journal of the Japanese Society of Internal Medicine, and it was also retracted in 2008 (Matsuyama et al., 2008), also for data problems, but it was retracted by the authors, unlike the case paper that is the focus of our study.

Citation context analysis for direct citations

Reused from prior study where available

In order to support our longitudinal analysis, definitions of citation context attributes are reused from the prior study (Fulton et al., 2015) which reported on 78 citations³ based on searches up to March 25, 2014, consisting of 24 citations published between 2006 and 2008 and 52 citations from 2009 forward.

Excluded items not available in full-text

We excluded 4 items whose full-text could not be obtained as of this writing: an embargoed Master's thesis in traditional Chinese (Lin, Yun-Jou, 2015) due to become available August 28, 2020; an Indonesian Ph.D. thesis (Hani, 2019) whose full text is currently embargoed to repository staff only; and two items with interlibrary loan requests pending, a journal article (Giudetti & Cagnazzo, 2011) and a second Chinese Master's thesis (Zheng, 2013).

Supplemental translations

In addition to Google Scholar, we used contributions from a native speaker (author DY) on texts in Chinese. Translations by a native speaker were used for three citation contexts in other languages (one article in Thai and two scanned articles in Japanese) due to problems copying non-Latin scripts and lossy optical character recognition.

Citation annotations

Citations were annotated as positive (i.e., affirmative use of the article) or negative (i.e., referring to the article as poor research), as in Appendix Table 1. Post-retraction citations were annotated as mentioning retraction or not, either by mentioning retraction in a citation context or in the bibliography by using words such as "Retraction" or "Retracted" or citing the retraction notice (CHEST, 2008), as in Appendix Table 2. Finally, we annotated whether the article described methods or results of the Matsuyama paper as opposed to citing a general concept. A fuller definition is given in (Fulton et al., 2015) using "specific" for the former and "in passing" for the latter, and we provide new examples below in Appendix Table 3. We classified an article as describing methods or results if at least one of its citation contexts did so.

Appendix Table 1 – Sample annotations of *positive* and *negative* citation contexts. Bolded reference numbers and strings refer to the Matsuyama paper.

Positive	Negative
"Additionally, some studies found that linoleic acid plays	"Another trial was retracted and so not included
important anti-inflammatory roles and could also improve	(Matsuyama 2005)." (Abdelhamid et al., 2018)
respiration in COPD patients [26, 27]." (Yang et al., 2015)	

Appendix Table 2 – Sample annotations of *mentions* and *doesn't mention* citation contexts. Bolded reference numbers refer to the Matsuyama paper.

Mentions	Doesn't Mention

³ The 76 citations from (Fulton et al., 2015) grouped 3 publications from 2011 and 2012 (Deng et al., 2012; Wang et al., 2012; Yin et al., 2011) considered as duplicate publications; we ungroup these below for a total of 78 citations from the prior study.

"This paper was retracted by the journal in 2008 [7],	"In addition, according to the site of the first
following an institutional investigation that found data had	double bond in the alkyl chain, PUFAs are
been falsified by the lead author." (Fulton et al., 2015)	usually divided into two categories: omega-3
-	and omega-6 fatty acids (Fig. 2) [15,16]." (Sun
	et al., 2017)

(same as Table 1 of the paper – repeated for convenience) Appendix Table 3 – Sample annotations of citation contexts that *described methods or results of the Matsuyama paper* and that *cited a general concept*. Bolded reference numbers and strings refer to the Matsuyama paper

Described Methods or Results of the Matsuyama paper	Cited a General Concept
"However, in a previous study conducted in Japan, patients with COPD were intervened with dietary supplementation of 400 kcal/d along with n-3 PUFAs of 0.6 g/d for 2 years, and compared to baseline SGRQ scores, the scores of symptoms, activity, impact, and total were 6, 4, 1.1 and 4 points lower respectively, yet the differences were insignificant, and so as the changes in lung function parameters (Matsuyama et al. , 2005)." (Lin et al., 2016)	"In addition, according to the site of the first double bond in the alkyl chain, PUFAs are usually divided into two categories: omega-3 and omega-6 fatty acids (Fig. 2) [15,16]." (Sun et al., 2017)

II. Analysis of the publications citing the 148 direct citations to the Matsuyama paper

Appendix Figure 2 outlines the process we used for analyzing the publications citing the 148 direct citations to the Matsuyama paper, which we refer to as second-generation citations to the Matsuyama paper.

This resulted in the identification of 2542 articles.

148 Direct Citations



Appendix Fig. 2 Flow diagram for the analysis of the second-generation citations to the Matsuyama paper

Search

We searched Web of Science and Google Scholar for publications citing the 148 direct citations to the Matsuyama paper. All forms of publications, published before December 31, 2019, in any language were included. Our search was conducted iteratively, as we refined our deduplication and cross-checking

procedures over time. Our main data collection took place on April 25, 2019 for Web of Science⁴ and from April 25, 2019 to May 4, 2019 using Publish or Perish Windows version 6 (Harzing, 2007) for Google Scholar, which covered 54 direct citations on Web of Science and (overlapping) 135 direct citations on Google Scholar. To update the search, an additional 11 direct citations were searched subsequently on January 15, 2020 (including the 8 new direct citations published in 2019).

Deduplication

We deduplicated records when multiple copies were found. First within Google Scholar, we checked second-generation citations citing the same article for title matches or partial title matches, and compared the full metadata record (author, publisher, etc.) or URL in order to identify duplicates. Then for second-generation citations citing the same article, we compared Web of Science and Google Scholar. Finally we identified second-generation citations that appeared multiple times (i.e., they cited multiple direct citations).

Data Cleaning for Year Information

We omitted publications with a missing publication year. When the listed publication year was before 2005 (the publication year of the Matsuyama paper), we manually verified the publication year, leading us to either update publication year errors or omitted publications actually published before 2005. To keep a consistent end date in our data, we removed citations after December 31, 2019. We also omitted publications with publication year before the publication year of the article they were supposed to cite.

Networks

Networks were plotted in R using custom code⁵ using the ggplot2 and igraph libraries, filtered using the tidyverse library.

III. Assess visibility of retraction status in digital platforms

This section provides full details about the visibility of the retraction status of the Matsuyama paper (Matsuyama et al., 2005) and its retraction notice (CHEST, 2008) in digital platforms. We repeat tables, figures, and sentences from the text in order to add relevant URLs.

Our final evaluations took place on January 12, 2020 and January 20, 2020 and (for ChestNet only) February 14, 2020, using the subscriptions of the University of Pittsburgh Health Sciences Library System (Pitt), which serves the academic medical center and health sciences schools of the University of Pittsburgh as well as hosting the National Network of Libraries of Medicine Regional Medical Library for the Middle Atlantic Region. Persistent linking errors in retraction notices reported in Table 8 below were rechecked using the subscriptions of the Library of the Health Sciences of the University of Illinois Chicago (UIC) on January 20, 2020 to confirm that these errors were not institution-specific.

NOTE: For convenience, the following tables follow the numbering of the text. They merely add URLs to those tables.

⁴ <u>https://github.com/infoqualitylab/Retraction-Case-Study-</u>

Matsuyama/blob/master/Python%20Code/wos%20web%20scraping.py

⁵ https://github.com/infoqualitylab/Retraction-Case-Study-

Matsuyama/blob/master/Network%20Diagram%20%26%20Timeline.R

Table 7 – Searches using the default search and entering the (Matsuyama et al., 2005) article title: Effects of omega-3 polyunsaturated fatty acids on inflammatory markers in COPD

Source	Retraction
	notice in
	search
	results
Chest – "All Content" search ⁶	Yes
CINAHL EBSCOhost ⁷	Yes
Cochrane CENTRAL ⁸	Yes
EMBASE ⁹	Yes
Google Scholar ¹⁰	No
MEDLINE – Ovid ¹¹	Yes
PubMed ¹²	Yes
ScienceDirect – keywords	Yes
search ¹³	
Semantic Scholar ¹⁴	Yes
Scopus ¹⁵	Yes
Web of Science – All	Yes
Databases ¹⁶	
Web of Science – Core	No
Collection ¹⁷	

Retraction

Chest, Volume 134, Issue 4, October 2008, Page 893

No authors available

Fig. 10 ScienceDirect shows the retraction notice CITE as record 82 of 194 in the default search¹⁸ for Effects of omega-3 polyunsaturated fatty acids on inflammatory markers in COPD as of January 20, 2020.

⁶ <u>https://journal.chestnet.org</u>

⁷ Institution-specific URL: <u>http://web.b.ebscohost.com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/ehost/search/basic?vid=0&sid=1705b812-8d81-4f76-8430-f9d2956ccbd4%40pdc-v-sessmgr01</u>

⁸ https://www.cochranelibrary.com

⁹ Institution-specific URL: <u>https://www-embase-com.pitt.idm.oclc.org</u>

¹⁰ <u>https://scholar.google.com</u>

¹¹ Institution-specific URL: <u>http://ovidsp.dc2.ovid.com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/sp-</u>

^{4.06.0}a/ovidweb.cgi?&S=MBFOFPGOOEEBJPPKJPAKLHBHOJCGAA00&New+Database=Single%7c0

¹² <u>https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/</u>

¹³ <u>https://www.sciencedirect.com</u>

¹⁴ <u>http://semanticscholar.org</u>

¹⁵ Institution-specific URL: <u>https://www-scopus-com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/</u>

¹⁶ Institution-specific URL: <u>http://apps.webofknowledge.com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/</u>

¹⁷ Institution-specific URL: <u>http://apps.webofknowledge.com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/</u>

¹⁸ https://www.sciencedirect.com/search/advanced?qs=Effects%20of%20omega-

^{3%20}polyunsaturated%20fatty%20acids%20on%20inflammatory%20markers%20in%20COPD&show=100

The retraction notice is the fourth result of four on January 20, 2020 when entering the title string in the "Search in this journal" search¹⁹ from the ScienceDirect journal homepage for *Chest*²⁰. However, the retraction notice was not found by entering the title string in ScienceDirect's Advanced search²¹ option "Title, abstract or author-specified keywords"; this search²² returned just 1 result, the retracted article, on January 20, 2020.

Retracted article on full-text sites

We considered full-text sources to be digital library sites that hosted PDFs²³. Table 5 – Retracted article on full-text sites

	"Retracte	"Retracted" text or watermark		Actionable link to retrac	tion notice	
Full-text source	On article landing page	On HTML article	On PDF article	From landing page	From HTML article	From PDF article
ChestNet.org	No	No	No	No	No	No
	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	No
Ovid Full Text						
ScienceDirect	No	No	No	No	No	No
SemanticScholar	Yes		No	No		No

Retraction notice in full-text sites

Table 6 - Retraction notice (CHEST, 2008) at full-text sources

	Front mat	ter	Heading content		Textual cont	Actionable links to the retracted article				
Full-text source	Listed in the table of contents	Has a page number?	Includes "Retraction" in the heading	Includes the title of the article in the heading	Indicates its authorship	Indicates the reason for the retraction	Includes a formal citation to retracted article	From landing page	From HTML full- text	From PDF full- text
ChestNet.org	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	No
ScienceDirect	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	No

Database records for the retracted article

Table 7 – Database records for the Matsuyama paper (Matsuyama et al., 2005)

¹⁹ <u>https://www.sciencedirect.com/search/advanced?qs=Effects%20of%20omega-</u> <u>3%20polyunsaturated%20fatty%20acids%20on%20inflammatory%20markers%20in%20COPD&pub=Chest&cid=280288</u>

²⁰ <u>https://www.sciencedirect.com/journal/chest</u>

²¹ https://www.sciencedirect.com/search/advanced

²² https://www.sciencedirect.com/search/advanced?tak=Effects%20of%20omega-

^{3%20}polyunsaturated%20fatty%20acids%20on%20inflammatory%20markers%20in%20COPD

 $^{^{23}}$ We excluded two sites, found via Google Scholar, that appeared to provide unofficial copies of the PDF, namely https://www.texasgrassfedbeef.com/sites/default/files/pdf/copd effects of omega-3 efa on inflammatory markers.pdf and https://smartfishsport.no/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Matsuyama-W-Effects-of-Omega-3-Polyunsaturated-Fatty-Acids-on-Inflammatory-Markers-in-COPD.pdf

Database	"Retraction" or "retracted" appears in the article record	Actionable link to the retraction notice	Article record has sufficient bibliographic information to retrieve the retraction notice manually by volume and issue number
CINAHL (EBSCOhost)	No	No	No
Cochrane CENTRAL (Wiley)	Yes	No	Yes
EMBASE	Yes	No	Yes
MEDLINE - Ovid	Yes	Yes	Yes
PubMed	Yes	No	No
Scopus	Yes	No	Yes
Semantic Scholar	No	No	No
Web of Science – All Databases	No	No	No
Web of Science – Core Collection	No	No	No

The CINAHL database did show some improvements during our study; the retraction notice was not found in our searches for Effects of omega-3 polyunsaturated fatty acids on inflammatory markers in COPD on September 27, 2018, but by January 2020, a second record with the retraction notice had appeared.²⁴

Database records for the retraction notice

Table 8 - Database records for the retraction notice (Matsuyama et al., 2005). Multiple resolution errors are due to presence of multiple link resolver buttons from a database.

Database	"Retraction notice" appears in the notice record	Notice record resolves to full- text notice	Resolution error(s)	Notice record has an actionable link to the retracted article	Notice record has sufficient bibliographic information to retrieve the retracted article manually by volume and issue number
----------	--	--	---------------------	---	---

²⁴ The CINAHL record lists an entry date of December 12, 2008 and revision date of February 27, 2019. Lacking further information about the revision, we hypothesize that it impacted the change in title search results. Pitt-specific URL: <u>http://search.ebscohost.com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/login.aspx?direct=true&db=cin20&AN=134926201&site=ehost-live</u> UIC-specific URL: <u>http://proxy.cc.uic.edu/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=rzh&AN=134926201</u>

CINAHL EBSCOhost ²⁵	Yes	Depends on link resolver ²⁶	Chest "This page does not exist" ²⁷ (Figure 11)	No	No
Cochrane CENTRAL	Yes	No	Links to PubMed—see PubMed line	Yes (2 clicks via the article PMID)	No
EMBASE – record 1 (copyright Elsevier)	Yes	No	ScienceDirect error "No results found" ²⁸ (Figure 12); Resolves to erratum for a different article ²⁹	No	No
EMBASE – 2 (MEDLINE sourced)	Yes	Depends on link resolver ³⁰	Resolves to retraction notice for a different article ³¹ (Figure 13)	No	Yes ³²
MEDLINE – Ovid	Yes	Yes		Yes (2 clicks via the article PMID)	Yes

²⁵ Pitt has CINHAL; UIC has CINAHL Plus with Full Text. Both are on the EBSCOhost platform.

This goes to the Chest "This page does not exist" error shown in Figure 10.

²⁶ Out of 3 links, resolution worked in 1: Findlt@UIC, a UIC-branded SerialSolutions link resolver, provides links to a landing page with two links. One, labelled "ScienceDirect journals" provides a correct result: a list of 2 search results giving retraction notices, one of which is the (CHEST, 2008) retraction notice at the UIC-specific URL https://www-sciencedirect-

<u>com.proxy.cc.uic.edu/search/advanced?page=893&docId=00123692&volume=134&issue=4</u>. The other UIC link, labelled "Publisher via CrossRef", goes back to the landing page itself and does not resolve; this circular link appeared in all FindIt@UIC results; we omit this point in subsequent footnotes for brevity.

²⁷ Pitt has CINHAL and their institution- and session-specific URL labelled "Check Article Availability" did not work: <u>http://web.a.ebscohost.com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/ehost/SmartLink/OpenIIsLink?sid=77b4fb83-010c-49d0-bf13-</u>

²³a142393ecb@sessionmgr4006&vid=2&sl=smartlink&st=ilslink_new&sv=sdbn%253Dcin20%2526pbt%253DAcademic%2520Jo urnal%2526issn%253D00123692%2526ttl%253DCHEST%2526stp%253DC%2526asi%253DY%2526ldc%253DCHECK%252520ART ICLE%252520AVAILABILITY%2526lna%253DSerials%252520Solutions%2526lca%253DfulText%2526lo%255Fan%253D13492620 1&su=http%3A%2F%2FRT4RF9QN2Y%2Esearch%2Eserialssolutions%2Ecom%3Fgenre%3Darticle%26title%3DCHEST%26atitle%3 DRetraction%2E%2520Effects%2520of%2520omega%2D3%2520polyunsaturated%2520fatty%2520acids%2520on%2520inflam matory%2520markers%2520in%2520COPD%2E%26author%3D%26authors%3D%26date%3D20081001%26volume%3D134%26i ssue%3D4%26spage%3D893%26issn%3D00123692 resolves to the institution-specific URL using SerialSolutions 360Link http://rt4rf9qn2y.search.serialssolutions.com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/?genre=article&title=CHEST&atitle=Retraction.%20Effects%20of %200mega-

^{3%20}polyunsaturated%20fatty%20acids%20on%20inflammatory%20markers%20in%20COPD.&author=&authors=&date=20081 001&volume=134&issue=4&spage=893&issn=00123692

²⁸ The UIC-specific link, labelled FindIt@UIC, resolves to a ScienceDirect error "No results found", apparently because the record page number, 892, should be 893, and the author name is a mismatch: with the UIC-specific URL <u>https://www-sciencedirect-</u>

com.proxy.cc.uic.edu/search/advanced?authors=Matsuyama%20W&page=892&docId=00123692&volume=134&issue=4

²⁹ "Full text on publisher's website" link resolves to erratum notice in *Chest* October 2008 for a different article https://doi.org/10.1016/S0012-3692(08)60334-7 Pitt-specific URL: https://www-sciencedirect-

com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/science/article/pii/S0012369208603347?via%3Dihub ; UIC-specific URL: https://www-sciencedirectcom.proxy.cc.uic.edu/science/article/pii/S0012369208603347?via%3Dihub

³⁰ Out of 4 links at UIC and Pitt, resolution worked in one case: The FindIt@UIC "ScienceDirect journals" provides a correct result: a list of 2 search results giving retraction notices, one of which is the (CHEST, 2008) retraction notice at the UIC-specific URL <u>https://www-sciencedirect-com.proxy.cc.uic.edu/search/advanced?page=893&docId=00123692&volume=134&issue=4</u>.

³¹ "Full text on publisher's website" link resolves to a retraction notice in *Chest* October 2008 for a different article https://doi.org/10.1016/S0012-3692(08)60340-2 ; Pitt-specific URL: https://www-sciencedirect-com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/science/article/pii/S001236920860347?via%3Dihub ; UIC-specific URL: https://www-sciencedirect-com.proxy.cc.uic.edu/science/article/pii/S001236920860347?via%3Dihub ; UIC-specific URL: https://www-sciencedirect-com.proxy.cc.uic.edu/science/article/pii/S0012369208603402?via%3Dihub

³² A page number error "3817-2827" needs to be interpreted to "3817-28".

PubMed	Yes	No	Elsevier: "Requested article is not found in IHub." ³³ (Figure 14)	Yes (2 clicks via the article PMID)	No
Semantic Scholar	Yes	No	Links to PubMed—see PubMed line	No	No
Scopus	No – classified as erratum	No	Chest "This page does not exist" ^{34 35} ; Chest homepage ³⁶ ; ScienceDirect "No results found" ³⁷ ; WorldCat not found message ³⁸	No	Yes ³⁹
Web of Science – All Databases	Yes	Depends on link resolver ⁴⁰	Elsevier: "Requested article is not found in IHub." ⁴¹	No	No

Delays in updating were also a factor; for instance, the Cochrane record for the retraction notice⁴² indicates that it was added October 31, 2014, six years after the retraction notice was published in October 2008. There are several inaccuracies: Scopus lists the retraction notice as an erratum⁴³, which it is not.

- ³⁴ "View at Publisher" goes to "This page does not exist" message at Chest: <u>https://www.chestjournal.org/cgi/reprint/134/4/892</u>
- ³⁵ Pitt-specific URL "Full Text@Pitt" (360 Link Serials Solutions link resolver) goes to "This page does not exist" message at *Chest*:
- http://rt4rf9qn2y.search.serialssolutions.com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/?sid=Elsevier:Scopus&genre=article&issn=00123692&volume=13 4&issue=4&spage=892&epage=&pages=892&artnum=&date=2008&title=Chest&atitle=Effects+of+omega-

3+polyunsaturated+fatty+acids+on+inflammatory+markers+in+COPD+%28Chest+%282005%29+128%2c+%283817-2827%29%29&aufirst=W.&auinit=W.&auinit1=W&aulast=Matsuyama&id=doi: and "View at Publisher"

https://www.chestjournal.org/cgi/reprint/134/4/892

³⁶ Pitt-specific URL: "Links@Pitt-UPMC" (EBSCOhost resolver) goes to Chest homepage

http://resolver.ebscohost.com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/openurl?custid=s3733374&authtype=ip&sid=Elsevier:Scopus&?sid=Elsevier:Scopus&genre=article&issn=00123692&isbn=&volume=134&issue=4&spage=892&epage=&pages=892&artnum=&date=2008&title=Chest&atitle=Effects+of+omega-

3+polyunsaturated+fatty+acids+on+inflammatory+markers+in+COPD+%28Chest+%282005%29+128%2c+%283817-2827%29%29&aufirst=W.&auinit1=W&aulast=Matsuyama&id=doi:

org.proxy.cc.uic.edu/atoztitles/link/?sid=Elsevier:Scopus&genre=article&issn=00123692&volume=134&issue=4&spage=892&ep age=&pages=892&artnum=&date=2008&title=Chest&atitle=Effects+of+omega-

com.proxy.cc.uic.edu/search/advanced?page=893&docId=00123692&volume=134&issue=4

com.proxy.cc.uic.edu/retrieve/pii/134/4/893-a

³³ <u>https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/134/4/893-a</u>

³⁷ The UIC-specific link, labelled FindIt@UIC, resolves to an error "No results found" with the UIC-specific URL XXX, apparently because the record page number, 892, should be 893, and the author name is a mismatch: <u>https://www-sciencedirect-com.proxy.cc.uic.edu/search/advanced?authors=Matsuyama%20W&page=892&docId=00123692&volume=134&issue=4</u>

³⁸ Three UIC-specific links, labelled 1cate, Journal Finder, and an unlabeled box, each took us to a WorldCat Link Resolver page indicating "We were unable to find direct full text links for this item" <u>https://uisbrookenslibrary-on-worldcat-</u>

<u>3+polyunsaturated+fatty+acids+on+inflammatory+markers+in+COPD+%28Chest+%282005%29+128%2c+%283817-2827%29%29&aufirst=W&auinit1=W&aulast=Matsuyama</u>

³⁹ A page number error "3817-2827" needs to be interpreted to "3817-28".

⁴⁰ Resolution worked in 1 of 2 "Find it@UIC links", retrieving a list of 2 search results giving retraction notices, one of which is the (CHEST, 2008) retraction notice at the UIC-specific URL https://www-sciencedirect-

⁴¹ "NCBI Links LinkOut" gave the "Requested article is not found in IHub." Message Pitt-specific URL: <u>https://linkinghub-elsevier-com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/retrieve/pii/134/4/893-a</u> UIC-specific URL: https://linkinghub-elsevier-

⁴² Pitt-specific URL: <u>https://www-cochranelibrary-com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/central/doi/10.1002/central/CN-</u>

^{01001062/}full?highlightAbstract=in%7Cfatti%7Cinflammatory%7Cwithdrawn%7Cpolyunsaturated%7Comega%7Ccopd%7Cacid%7Ceffects%7Cacids%7C3%7Comeg%7Cfatty%7Cmarker%7Cof%7Cinflammatori%7Ceffect%7Cmarkers%7Cpolyunsatur

⁴³ Pitt-specific URL: <u>https://www-scopus-com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/record/display.uri?eid=2-s2.0-</u> 54249092126&origin=resultslist&sort=plf-f&src=s&st1=Effects+of+omega-

³⁺polyunsaturated+fatty+acids+on+inflammatory+markers+in+COPD&st2=&sid=1d99b35c47cb8a7ed1a1f11b3648a3f7&sot=b

	HEST Organization ~ For	Advertisers - For Author	s * For Readers *	Store
OFFICIAL PUBLICATI	ON OF THE AMERICAN COLLE	GE OF CHEST PHYSICIANS		Login Register Activate Access Subscribe
Articles & Issues ~	CHEST: Visual and Interactive ~	Guidelines Meeting Abstra Search Adva	acts Sections Topi inced Search	Share this page 🔣 🚺 💟 🖸 🚺
An error The page or action y This page does	thas occurred rou requested has resulted in an s not exist	I error. Please go back to the pr	evious page by using yo	ur browser's Back button, or visit the <u>Home Page</u> .

Fig. 9 The ChestNet error page⁴⁴ stating "This page does not exist", retrieved from the "Check article availability" link from the EBSCOhost CINAHL record for the retraction notice⁴⁵ (CHEST, 2008) on January 20, 2020.



Fig. 10 The ScienceDirect Error page⁴⁶ stating "No results found", retrieved from EMBASE – record 1 (copyright Elsevier)⁴⁷ for (CHEST, 2008) via the FindItUIC ScienceDirect journals link⁴⁸ on January 20, 2020.

⁴⁸ UIC-specific URL

[&]amp;sdt=b&sl=93&s=TITLE-ABS-KEY%28Effects+of+omega-

³⁺polyunsaturated+fatty+acids+on+inflammatory+markers+in+COPD%29&relpos=1&citeCnt=0&searchTerm=

⁴⁴ Institution-specific URL

http://rt4rf9qn2y.search.serialssolutions.com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/?genre=article&title=CHEST&atitle=Retraction.%20Effects%20of %20omega-

<u>3%20polyunsaturated%20fatty%20acids%20on%20inflammatory%20markers%20in%20COPD.&author=&authors=&date=20081</u> 001&volume=134&issue=4&spage=893&issn=00123692

⁴⁵Institution-specific URL <u>http://web.a.ebscohost.com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/ehost/detail/detail?vid=2&sid=77b4fb83-010c-49d0-bf13-23a142393ecb%40sessionmgr4006&bdata=JnNpdGU9ZWhvc3QtbGl2ZQ%3d%3d#AN=134926201&db=cin20</u>

⁴⁶ UIC-specific URL <u>https://www-sciencedirect-</u>

com.proxy.cc.uic.edu/search/advanced?authors=Matsuyama%20W&page=892&docId=00123692&volume=134&issue=4
⁴⁷ UIC-specific URL https://www-embase-

com.proxy.cc.uic.edu/a/#/search/results?subaction=viewrecord&rid=3&page=1&id=L352538781

http://hz9pj6fe4t.search.serialssolutions.com.proxy.cc.uic.edu/log?L=HZ9PJ6FE4T&D=FDB&J=CHES&P=Link&PT=EZProxy &A=Effects+of+omega-



Fig. 11 The Elsevier errata notice for a different article (Acute ST-Segment Elevation Myocardial Infarction)⁴⁹, retrieved from the "Full text on publisher's website" from the EMBASE Elsevier record for the retraction notice⁵⁰ (CHEST, 2008) on January 20, 2020.

	Requested article is not found in IHub.
ELSEVIER	
	URL: https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/134/4/893-a
Date/Tir	me of Error: 01/20/2020 06:52:16 PM
Ref	erring URL: https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/
Please h Enter th	Elsevier Logo e title, source, and authors of the article you are looking for in the box below.
Send	

3+polyunsaturated+fatty+acids+on+inflammatory+markers+in+COPD+%28Chest+%282005%29+128%2C+%283817-2827%29%29&H=5432fd0f82&U=http%3A%2F%2Fproxy.cc.uic.edu%2Flogin%3Furl%3Dhttps%3A%2F%2Fwww.sciencedir ect.com%2Fscience%2Flink%3Fref_val_fmt%3Dinfo%3Aofi%2Ffmt%3Akev%3Amtx%3Ajournal%26svc_val_fmt%3Dinfo%3 Aofi%2Ffmt%3Akev%3Amtx%3Asch_srv%26rfr_dat%3Dsaltver%3A1%26rfr_dat%3Dorigin%3ASERIALSSOL%26ctx_enc% 3Dinfo%3Aofi%2Fenc%3AUTF-8%26ctx_ver%3DZ39.88-

com.proxy.cc.uic.edu/search/advanced?authors=Matsuyama%20W&page=892&docId=00123692&volume=134&issue=4 ⁴⁹ https://doi.org/10.1016/S0012-3692(08)60334-7

⁵⁰ Institution-specific URL: <u>https://www-embase-</u>

com.pitt.idm.oclc.org/a/#/search/results?subaction=viewrecord&rid=3&page=1&id=L352538781

^{2004%26}rft.issn%3D00123692%26rft.volume%3D134%26rft.issue%3D4%26rft.spage%3D892%26rft.epage%3D-%26rft.aulast%3DMatsuyama%26rft.auinit1%3DW%26rft.date%3D2008%26rfr_dat%3Dmd5%3A3ca791f67be7b97c0c555534 68cf468f resolving to UIC-specific URL https://www-sciencedirect-

Fig. 12 The Elsevier error page⁵¹ stating "Requested article is not found in IHub.", retrieved from the link out from the PubMed page for the retraction notice⁵² (CHEST, 2008) on January 20, 2020.

Bibliography

- Abdelhamid, A. S., Brown, T. J., Brainard, J. S., Biswas, P., Thorpe, G. C., Moore, H. J., Deane, K. H. O., AlAbdulghafoor, F. K., Summerbell, C. D., Worthington, H. V., Song, F., & Hooper, L. (2018). Omega-3 fatty acids for the primary and secondary prevention of cardiovascular disease. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*, *11*, CD003177. https://doi.org/10.1002/14651858.CD003177.pub4
- Chen, C., Hu, Z., Milbank, J., & Schultz, T. (2013). A visual analytic study of retracted articles in scientific literature. *Journal of the American Society for Information Science and Technology*, *64*(2), 234–253. https://doi.org/10.1002/asi.22755
- CHEST. (2008). Retraction [of Effects of omega-3 polyunsaturated fatty acids on inflammatory markers in COPD]. *Chest*, 134(4), 893. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0012-3692(08)60339-6
- Deng, C., Cao, Y.-F., Chen, X.-X., & Yin, Z. B. (2012). ω-3 鱼油脂肪乳对博莱霉素致肺纤维化大鼠的干预作用 [The effects of

omega-3 fat emulsion on bleomycin-induced pulmonary fibrosis in rats]. 广东医学[Guangdong Medical Journal],

32(18), 2370-2372.

- Fulton, A. S., Coates, A. M., Williams, M. T., Howe, P. R. C., & Hill, A. M. (2015). Persistent citation of the only published randomised controlled trial of Omega-3 supplementation in Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease six years after its retraction. *Publications*, 3(1), 7–26. https://doi.org/10.3390/publications3010017
- Giudetti, A. M., & Cagnazzo, R. (2011). Lipids in the nutritional treatment of inflammatory diseases. *Multidisciplinary Respiratory Medicine*, *6*(2), 97–106.
- Hani, S. Z. (2019). Pengaruh pemberian suplemen omega 3 terhadap kadar TNF-α serum, massa otot, kekuatan otot, dan performa fisik pada pasien ppok dengan sarkopenia [Effect of omega 3 supplementation on serum TNF-α levels, muscle mass, muscle strength, and physical performance in patients with COPD with sarcopenia] [Master's, Universitas Andalas]. http://scholar.unand.ac.id/49966/

Harzing, A. W. (2007). Publish or Perish. https://harzing.com/resources/publish-or-perish

⁵¹ https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/134/4/893-a

⁵² <u>https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/18842931</u>

- Lin, Y.-C., Lin, Y.-J., Wu, T.-C., Cheng, C.-C., & Yeh, S.-L. (2016). Supplementation of fish oil improves functional capacity and quality of life in patients with Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease. *Current Topics in Nutraceutical Research*, *14*(3), 191–198.
- Lin, Yun-Jou. (2015). 魚油補充對慢性阻塞性肺病患者骨骼健康狀況, 活動能力及生活品質之影響 [Effects of fish oil supplementation on bone health status, physical performance, and quality of life in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease] [Master's, Zhangjiakou University]. http://dx.doi.org/10.6834/CSMU.2013.00035
- Matsuyama, W., Higashimoto, I., Osame, M., & Arimura, K. (2006). In Replay: Renin-Angiotensin System Blockade and COPD. *Chest*, *129*(6), 1735. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0012-3692(15)50791-5
- Matsuyama, W., Mitsuyama, H., Koreeda, Y., Higashimoto, I., Osame, M., & Arimura, K. (2007). [RETRACTED] Use of tiotropium bromide for pre-operative treatment in chronic obstructive pulmonary disease patients: Comparison with oxitropium bromide. *Internal Medicine*, *46*(17), 1373–1380. https://doi.org/10.2169/internalmedicine.46.0072
- Matsuyama, W., Mitsuyama, H., Koreeda, Y., Higashimoto, I., Osame, M., & Arimura, K. (2008). RETRACTION: Use of Tiotropium Bromide for Pre-operative Treatment in Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease Patients: Comparison with Oxitropium Bromide. *Internal Medicine*, *47*(14), 1371–1371. https://doi.org/10.2169/internalmedicine.47.R001
- Matsuyama, W., Mitsuyama, H., Watanabe, M., Oonakahara, K., Higashimoto, I., Osame, M., & Arimura, K. (2005). [RETRACTED] Effects of Omega-3 Polyunsaturated Fatty Acids on Inflammatory Markers in COPD. *Chest*, *128*(6), 3817–3827. https://doi.org/10.1378/chest.128.6.3817
- Sun, B., Luo, C., Cui, W., Sun, J., & He, Z. (2017). Chemotherapy agent-unsaturated fatty acid prodrugs and prodrugnanoplatforms for cancer chemotherapy. *Journal of Controlled Release*, 264, 145–159. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jconrel.2017.08.034
- Wang, H., Yin, Z., Chen, X., & Cao, Y. (2012). 鱼油脂肪乳和 20% 中/长链脂肪乳干预博莱霉素致大鼠肺纤维化效果的比较 [The intervention effect of ω-3 PUFA and MCT/LCT fatty acids in rats model of pulmonary fibrosis by Bleomycin]. *肠外 与肠内营养* [Parenteral and Enteral Nutrition], 2012–04, 228-231+ 234.
- Yang, L., Li, J., Li, Y., Tian, Y., Li, S., Jiang, S., Wang, Y., & Song, X. (2015). Identification of metabolites and metabolic pathways related to treatment with Bufei Yishen formula in a rat COPD model using HPLC Q-TOF/MS. *Evidence-Based Complementary and Alternative Medicine*, 2015. https://doi.org/10.1155/2015/956750
- Yin, Z., Deng, C., Cao, Y., & Chen, Y. (2011). ω-3 鱼油脂肪乳和中/长链脂肪乳注射液干预博莱霉素致肺纤维化大鼠效果的比较 [Comparison of the effects of omega-3 fish oil fat emulsion and medium/long chain fat emulsion injection on

bleomycin-induced pulmonary fibrosis in rats]. *中华临床营养杂志* [Chinese Journal of Clinical Nutrition], 19(6), 400–403.

Zheng J. (2013). [Effects of omega-3 polyunsaturated fatty acids and exercise rehabilitation on bone health in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease] Omega-3多元不飽和脂肪酸及運動復健介入對慢性阻塞性肺病患者骨骼健康之影響[Master's, Zhongshan Medical University]. https://doi.org/10.6834/CSMU.2013.00035